

Chloe Vaina
Term: Winter 2023

Introduction

Originally, we chose this location as the focus of our interest because it provides a wealth of services to the community and is situated in a non-traditional setting for commerce, as it is in the middle of a large park complex. Questions arose about what kinds of services the Downsvue Park merchants market was providing, to whom and how. Once we determined that these were essential services provided to a variety of individuals in the wider community, we were struck by some comments and concerns over the wave of closures costing the city many of its flea markets and affordable shopping spaces. In fact, some of these spaces have been reputable like Honest Ed's for example. However, unlike many of its counterparts, the Downsvue Park merchants' market has been able to resist development pressure beyond the time other flea markets in the city have. We seek to understand the underlying drivers of this market's resilience to development pressures to determine how to protect and promote spaces that serve communities in a similar fashion. For the purpose of this study we define resilience as the ability to resist negative pressures and persist in the space over a prolonged period of time. We argue that our field work has provided us with evidence of two outstanding factors in relation to this market's resilience. The first being the use of place making which allows the market to behave as a third place and be protected by its status as such. Second, the use of place making for the extractive processes by which development and gentrification can benefit from the market's presence. Evidence of this can be seen in the interview process and in the content of the interviews.

Literature review

Looking at the Downsvue Park merchants' market we became interested in how it served the community. Our inquiries into this topic lead us to look to understand how this market has resisted development pressure in the face of multiple market closures elsewhere in the city. The development of our research question rested on the crux of the perceived resiliency in the face of gentrification pressures. We argue that it is through the multiple characteristics of a third place that the market creates a reputation and clientele that increase its resiliency. Together with phenomenological placemaking, the concept of third places allows us to describe the particularities of the Downsvue Park Merchants Market which we perceive to result in increased resilience. Based on the academic concepts of resilience, placemaking and third places in academic discourse we can define them as follows.

Resilience

For this study's purpose, we define resilience as the ability to withstand displacement by development pressures. More broadly however, resilience is understood to be "the capacity of a system to undergo change and still retain its basic function and structure after facing an external disturbance" (Taşan-Kok, T., Stead, D., & Lu, P., 2012). In their chapter entitled *Resilience thinking in urban planning* Taşan-Kok, T., Stead, D., & Lu, P quote from ecological principles in an insightful manner, defining resilience "the amount of disturbance that an ecosystem can withstand without changing its self-organised processes and structures" (Taşan-Kok, T., Stead, D., & Lu, P., 2012). Phenomenological Placemaking

Phenomenological placemaking is a concept described by Aravot in their paper *Back to Phenomenological Placemaking*. Which describes a sense of place resulting from placemaking as a human need and "essential for wellbeing and feelings of safety, security and orientation, and a remedy against feelings of alienation and estrangement" (Aravot, 2002). The author argues that this disillusionment is a result of "the exploitation of placemaking as a means rather than an end in itself" (Aravot, 2002). Aravot defines placemaking more precisely as the "exploitation of place as a commodity or in the service of power structures" and argues that this "does not render it unfitting as a response to basic human needs," (Aravot, 2002). The paper argues that placemaking can be divided into locale meaning social relations, location referring to relations to economic networks and sense of place describing psychological relations (Aravot, 2002). More generally though, a sense of place is described as "a social construct, and its value [is] determined by social processes, much more than by any material attributes" (Aravot, 2002). She adds "there is plenty of evidence to support placemaking as another professional narrative in the service of economic interests, engendered by inner-city crisis." (Aravot, 2002). Evidence of which we can identify in the history of Honest Ed's for example. Despite the evidence of phenomenological placemaking in this context it was unable to withstand development pressures. Therefore, phenomenological placemaking alone is not sufficient to provide long-standing resilience.

Third places

In his writings about third places Oldenburg writes, "Many men who still work in small shops will be found to keep a few chairs around the store in which they spend many happy hours with friends who drop by." (Oldenburg, 1982). In fact, we did just that. I was offered a whiskey and a stool and sat with them for the duration of my interview in the back of their shop watching people come by occasionally interrupting the train of thought to which we could return upon pouring another drink. Occasionally inquiring about children, endeavours and day-to-day life, what we did with our time and who certain market goers were. Oldenburg also addresses the types of interactions that occur in third places as being particular to them, saying that it is, "a public setting

accessible to its inhabitants and appropriated by them as their own" (Oldenburg, 1982). By drinking in a space for economic exchange that is not benefiting from this action, not only are we appropriating the space for our own purpose, but we are "merely hanging out" in the words Oldenburg uses to describe third places. An additional characteristic identified in his work is that the dominant activity is not special, rather it is taken for granted as part of their social experience and is a "forum of association which is beneficial only to the degree that it is well integrated into daily life" (Oldenburg, 1982).

Methodology

Process

We collected information from the market both through notes and observation, following this up with interviews conducted using the accelerated intimacy approach with a variety of types of users of the space. This allowed us to understand the perspectives of multiple users of the space. We began with our walkthrough and note taking drawing from our experiences in the space to build connections with those we perceived to have knowledge or opinions about the space that may be enlightening. This included individuals who make the space their source of economic sustenance like vendors and consumers but also looks at the administrative perspective of the decision makers of the market. Those who were willing to interact with us without our prompting were perceived more likely to cooperate with our endeavours to formulate data from the site through subsequent interviews.

Arriving at the location of the market on a day where it is closed shows us the stark contrast created by the market's ability for placemaking when it is operational. Upon the first walkthrough, the space was a large barren expanse of land and industrial storage and a large parking lot. Originally, what was particularly interesting, was its connection to the space and amenities directly surrounding it within the park, as well as the infrastructure surrounding it, such as the railroad subway station and airport, which all affected the way the park was laid out and the ability for the market to be well connected to the rest of the community outside of the park. We worked our way towards a more specific question. How do phenomenological placemaking and the characteristics of third places play a role in increasing resiliency and allowing economic interactions and services to persist through gentrification pressures?

Analysis

For the analysis of data, we chose to encode our findings directly from transcription of interviews and notes taken from the site. These were then grouped together by overarching themes that were used to understand relationships between the space and its usages and users. To examine how this space did or did not fit the

criteria of a third place, we separated data into main criteria such as safety, recreation, sustenance, and community or belonging.

Reflection on methods

Originally, our perception of the space was tainted by our academic background, which has taught us that hostier spaces are designed with the intention of excluding certain parties. Our positionality affected the data we collected because we are not regulars, and we stand out visually as white university age students. This means the information we collected was affected by the perception of us by others who may have given answers based on their best interests as they perceived us. Even just taking notes and pictures drove us to be met with skepticism and frightful looks from vendors. This led us to be intercepted by security who informed us that we were worrying vendors. Our interest shifted to what this behaviour revealed about the greater conditions of the market compared to other markets which were revealed to have seen a wave of closures to which this particular one was able to resist. Our conversation with Robert who is in a managerial position revealed not only intrinsic factors to the resilience of the Downsview Park merchants' market but also extrinsic ones, visible in the recent development of the Downsview Park subway station and the newly developed residential sector adjacent to the park.

When we went to meet one of our interviewees on a separate occasion, a man sitting in the food court indicated where we were to each other "she's over there" he said pointing to the other entrance. This immediate recognition of anything and anyone out of place may stem from a protectiveness that has been instilled through perceived threats in the past or from other external sources and therefore cannot be dismissed. Due to the rapidly changing rate of development and the difficulties of transparency within larger structures of urban redevelopment, we were unable to pursue the avenue brought up by Robert in his interview about the market's resilience being in developer's interests. As gentrification processes take over spaces in waves it is possible that the geographic area in which the market is located has simply not experienced these pressures at the same rate as other areas that have seen affordable market closures. There is a possibility that this is colouring how well we perceive the market to be resilient in comparison to other markets. For example, Honest Eds was a renowned affordable shopping location that served the community. It sat in a similar fashion to the Downsview Park market. Unlike the Downsview merchants' market, it is unable to withstand development pressures and succumbed to them, leaving way to massive mostly unaffordable condominium development.

Results data

Our interviews yielded information we used to set up interviews with individuals who may have more knowledge of the concept's interviewees touched on. For example, upon interviewing Deven, who works security, we were instructed to speak to a man named Robert who managed the place. This interview allowed us to assess who might be willing to speak to us about more administrative questions concerning the market. In combination with the other interviews, we extracted a variety of passages that highlight the underlying motivations for interactions within the market and formed them into codes and themes in a process called encoding data.

Among the non-administrative interviewees, the process extracted a sense of community, belonging, identity and sustenance. We found codes such as second home, references to tenure, codes for identity, safety community, belonging recreation, sustenance, and affordability. Interviewees referred to these themes through codes like making friendships and being loved through his sold books in the case of Prabhu or being able to “grow” in the case of Shaunique. Among the interviewees related to the market in administrative capacities, a relationship of support from developers and government officials and a sense of duty of the contribution to the spade in the larger context of the community were revealed. Access to products and a place for economic exchange through affordability is also a theme present in both administrative and non-administrative interviewees indicated by discussions of commercial rent expense and access to products. Also, the notion of phenomenological placemaking is present in codes like not needing to purchase to be welcome in the space over a long period of time or the talk of there being a diversity of people from different places and this being beneficial to the prosperity of the market. Additionally, administrative interviewees addressed the ownership structure of the space, speaking about Lands Canada owning the park it sits in for example and the development of infrastructure requiring massive investment on the part of government. These highlight themes indicative of phenomenological placemaking such as the exploitation of placemaking in the interest of protecting the longevity of the market by aligning it to developers interests in sought after sites surrounding their developments.

Analysis

To develop a sense of how heightened resilience to gentrification and development pressures is achieved in the context of the Downsview Park merchants' market we can compare it to other markets that have seen closures. Such as Honest Ed's, a renowned shopping spot known for its phenomenological placemaking and the Leslieville Flea. How, if at all, does the Downsview Park merchants market differ from Honest Ed's for example in ways that may allow it to withstand the pressures of development and gentrification?

Our findings collected from the interview process indicate that the combined characteristics of a third place that allow the space to persist. These include the recreational, cultural, and social uses of the space inherent to third places. Additionally, we found evidence that the relationship between administration and surrounding governing bodies has helped the market renew its leases on the space. However, this relationship is likely to change as the area becomes invested in by condominium corporations and developers. For example, it is mentioned that the new development of the subway station is for the interests of attracting investment from developers. This highlights the possibility that the market is maintaining its position in the community due to it being in the interest of stakeholders. Although phenomenological placemaking did not protect markets such as Honest Ed's, utilised in combination with the protection of the characteristics of third places these factors can make spaces that provide a wealth of services to a larger community more resilient to gentrification processes. Achieving this requires using phenomenological placemaking in their own interests.

Much of our encoding connects codes to themes that align with the idea of phenomenological placemaking described by Aravot that describes placemaking as "another professional narrative in the service of economic interests, engendered by inner-city crisis." (Aravot, 2002). Encoding also reveals themes that highlight the aspect of a third place according to the definitions and characteristics Oldenburg puts forward such as interactions happening in a "free and uninhibited atmosphere of third place fellowship, [in which] conversation is remarkably democratic." (Aravot, 2002). Another example of encoding leading to aspects of third places described by Oldenburg is present in our interview with Prabhu who described how personal issues were minimised in an effort to engage with others described by Oldenburg as pure sociability, a characteristic of a third place. He describes pure sociability as "the antithesis of a "group therapy session" and if souls are saved therein, as well they may be, it is only incidentally." (Oldenburg, 1982).

The evidence of these themes does not guarantee market resilience. However, it is likely that using both concepts as drivers for the market's longevity by aligning it with the interest of those who would otherwise be forces of displacement. The unique placement of the market on government owned land also provides an additional layer of protection from these pressures as it would require the land to be sold through governmental processes rather than between private entities. This allows a space "where people gather primarily to enjoy each other's company." to be protected in its provision of this service among the multitude the Downsview Park merchants market provides.

Conclusion

Our observations and experiences in the spaces indicate a heightened protectiveness of the market. Our interviews have allowed us to determine two main drivers for resilience in this space. The first is the protection of the qualities of third places as described by Oldenburg including perceived safety, community, belonging and recreation. The second is the use of phenomenological placemaking for extractive purposes that suit the interest of developers, dispelling their desire to do away with the space. Through the exploration of other case studies, it is possible to understand that these must be utilised in conjunction with each other and in a manner that promotes the space's longevity to benefit the resilience of this type of space in the face of gentrification.

Bibliography

- Aravot, I. (2002). Back to phenomenological placemaking. *Journal of Urban Design*, 7(2), 201–212. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1357480022000012230>
- Taşan-Kok, T., Stead, D., & Lu, P. (2012). Conceptual overview of resilience: History and context. *Resilience thinking in urban planning*, 39–51.
- Oldenburg, R., & Brissett, D. (1982). The third place. *Qualitative Sociology*, 5(4), 265–284. <https://doi.org/10.1007/bf00986754>